Debate Challenge #1
Engineering Ethics
September 5, 2006
2:00 – 2:50pm

This class session will be a debate on the use of software; the case is described below. You will need to do some research to determine the facts of the case. The class will be divided into four teams.

Team #1 will take the position “The individuals from OSU behaved ethically.” Team #2 will take the position “The individuals from OSU behaved unethically.” Teams #3 and #4 will act as judges. (For Debate Challenge #2, Teams #1 and #2 will act as judges.)

Each member of Teams 1 and 2 will prepare a 1-page written defense of their position that will be due at the beginning of the class session. (Use Microsoft Word, or some other word-processing software.) At the class session, each member of Team #1 and #2 will give a three-minute presentation of their case. (Use Microsoft Power Point, or some other presentation software.) After each presentation, there will be one question from the opposing team, with a one-minute response. The presentations will rotate from Team #1 to Team #2, as below:

Team #1, 1st presenter (3 minutes)
  Team #2, 1st question (30 seconds) and Team #1 reply (1 minute)
Team #2, 1st presenter (3 minutes)
  Team #1, 1st question (30 seconds) and Team #2 reply (1 minute)
Team #1, 2nd presenter (3 minutes)
  Team #2, 2nd question (30 seconds) and Team #1 reply (1 minute)

etc.

The members of Teams #3 and #4 will act as judges. They will not have any assignment due at the beginning of class. They will take notes during the debate of the key points being made. At the end of the class, they will turn in their notes and will answer two questions: 1) Which team made the better case? 2) In your opinion, were the individuals ethical or unethical? Why? Be prepared to write this up neatly as a single paragraph and justify your decision.

Grading (Total of 80 points.)
• Attendance at the class session is worth 40 points.
• There will be 40 points assigned for your written preparation for class and for your participation in the class discussion, according to your assigned job, as described above.
Software Usage Case

Dr. Gary Wiggins was Vice President of the Information Technology Center at OSU until the summer of 2004. Dr. Wiggins hired Mr. Brandon LaBonte as Director of Software Services and Mr. Michael Hewett as his assistant. All three came from Texas Tech University. In the spring of 2003, it was discovered that some software that was being publicly used by OSU was very similar to software developed and used at Texas Tech. OSU eventually paid a monetary fee to settle alleged copyright infringement. The situation ultimately led to the resignations of Mr. LaBonte, Mr. Hewett and Dr. Wiggins.

Your assignment is to research the facts of the case (all teams) and to argue that:

Team #1: These three individuals acted **ethically**.
Team #2: They acted **unethically**.

To obtain the entire story, you will need to research articles written about these events. Your argument should be based on facts as reported (cite the sources) and not on opinion alone. To begin your research, we suggest a Google search with the keywords LaBonte and Hewett. You might also go to the OSU website (www.okstate.edu) and search with the keywords LaBonte and Hewett.

NOTE: Work is individual. Each team member is to hand in his/her assignment.

**If your last name is:**

| Barnes, Choa, Clincy, Cline, Cogburn | 1 |
| Cowan, Hacena, Harrison, Kanga-Tharalingam, Littlefield | 2 |
| Littlejohn, Maxson, Mouse, Newman, Soper | 3 |
| Strickler, Taliaferro, Ward, Wartley, Williams | 4 |